

---

MINUTES OF PVTA'S  
ADVISORY BOARD MEETING  
January 24, 2018

The Advisory Board Meeting of the Pioneer Valley Transit Authority was held on Wednesday, January 24, 2018 at the Pioneer Valley Transit Authority Office located at 2808 Main Street in Springfield, MA, at 12:00 P.M.

**1. ROLL CALL**

	<u>Present (48.87 votes)</u>	<u>Not Present (13.12 vote)</u>
Agawam	Michael Squindo	
Amherst	Douglas Slaughter	
Belchertown	Brian O'Leary	
Chicopee	Steve Huntley	
East Longmeadow	Carolyn Brennan	
Easthampton	Mayor Nicole LaChapelle	
Granby	Jessica Langlois	
Hadley	David Moskin	
Hampden	Becky Moriarty	
Holyoke		Mayor Alex Morse
Leverett		Peter D'Errico
Longmeadow	Mark Gold	
Ludlow		Brian Mannix
Northampton	Mayor David Narkewicz	
Palmer	Paul Burns Johnson	
Pelham		William Martell
South Hadley	Marilyn Ishler	
Springfield	Anthony Wilson	
Sunderland		Sherry Patch
Ware	Nancy Talbot	
West Springfield	Jim Czach	
Westfield		Peter Miller
Wilbraham	Paula Dubord	
Williamsburg	J.M. Sorrell	
ADA Representative	Jennifer Carbery	
Rider Representative		TBD

Other Designee's Present: Brendan Rogers, Easthampton

A quorum of 31.01 majority vote being present, Chairman Mayor Narkewicz called the meeting of PVTA's Advisory Board to order at 12:07 PM; majority vote of 48.87 present.

## **2. PUBLIC COMMENT**

Chairman Mayor Narkewicz opened the floor for public comments. No public comments were made.

## **3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Chairman Mayor Narkewicz asked for a motion from the Advisory Board to approve the meeting minutes from the Regular Advisory Board Meeting on November 15, 2017.

**Motion:** Moved and seconded (O'Leary/Huntley) to approve the meeting minutes from the Regular Advisory Board Meeting on November 15, 2017.

Chairman Narkewicz asked if the Board had any discussion. Hearing none. Chairman Narkewicz asked all those in favor to say aye.

Motion passed by a unanimous vote.

## **4. REPORT OF THE FINANCE & AUDIT COMMITTEE**

Steve Huntley, Chairman of the Finance & Audit Committee reported the following:

The Finance & Audit Committee met prior to today's Board Meeting. The committee voted to approve the Finance & Audit Minutes of November 13, 2017.

The Committee received a report on the 5-month budget to actual and presentations on the proposed fare increase scenarios and service reduction scenarios.

The Finance & Audit Committee voted to accept and recommend to the Board going out to public hearings with a 25% fare increase proposal and also voted to recommend a multi-year increase with a 25% fare increase in FY19 then a 5% per year increase implemented every three years.

Chairman Mayor Narkewicz asked if the Board had any discussion. Hearing none. Chairman Mayor Narkewicz asked for a motion from the Advisory Board to accept the report of the Finance & Audit Committee.

**Motion:** Moved and seconded (Ishler/O'Leary) to accept the report of the Finance & Audit Committee.

Chairman Mayor Narkewicz asked if the Board had any discussion. Hearing none, asked all those in favor to say aye.

Motion passed by a unanimous vote.

## **5. REPORT OF THE ROUTE COMMITTEE**

Chairman of the Route Committee, Brian O'Leary, reported that the Route Committee held their meeting in conjunction with the Paratransit Committee on January 8, 2018. The Route Committee voted to approve the meeting minutes from December 13, 2017.

The committee received a presentation on the fare and service change proposals and was presented with seven different scenarios to go to public hearings on for the proposed service changes which were:

Scenario 1: Prioritize Geographic Coverage by Preserving Bus Routes Region wide

Scenario 2: Prioritize High Ridership Routes

Scenario 3: Reduce Non-required Van and Bus Services

Scenario 4: Reduce Off-Peak Weekend and Holiday Service

Scenario 5 Reduce Off-peak and Restructure Low Performing Routes and Services

Scenario 6: Prioritize Weekday Geographic Coverage and Weekend High Ridership Routes

Scenario 7: Return to FY13 Level of Service

After much discussion the Route Committee voted to recommend to the Board going out to public hearings on scenario five.

Chairman Mayor Narkewicz asked for a motion from the Advisory Board to accept the report of the Route Committee.

**Motion:** Moved and seconded (Burns/Ishler) to accept the report of the Route Committee.

Chairman Mayor Narkewicz asked if the Board had any discussion. Hearing none. Asked all those in favor to say aye.

Motion passed by a unanimous vote.

## **6. REPORT OF THE PARATRANSIT COMMITTEE**

Carolyn Brennan, Chairperson of the Paratransit Committee, reported that the Paratransit Committee met in conjunction with the Route Committee on January 8, 2018. The Paratransit Committee voted to approve the meeting minutes from May 24, 2017.

The Paratransit Committee received a presentation on the proposed fare and service changes and also voted to recommend to the Board going out to public hearings on scenario five.

Chairman Mayor Narkewicz asked for a motion from the Advisory Board to accept the report of the Paratransit Committee.

**Motion:** Moved and seconded (Burns/O'Leary) to accept the report of the Paratransit Committee.

Chairman Mayor Narkewicz asked if the Board had any discussion. Hearing none, asked all those in favor to say aye.

Motion passed by a unanimous vote.

## **7. SUB COMMITTEE APPOINTMENTS**

Chairman Mayor Narkewicz asked if any other members were interested in joining a sub-committee.

Chairman Mayor Narkewicz appointed the following members to PVTA's Advisory Board Sub-Committee's for 2018.

### **Finance & Audit Committee Members**

Doug Slaughter, Chairman

Steve Huntley

Brian O'Leary

Marilyn Ishler  
David Moskin

Paratransit Committee Members

Steve Huntley, Chairman  
Carolyn Brennan  
Paul Burns Johnson  
Paula Dubord  
Mark Gold  
Marilyn Ishler  
Brian O'Leary  
Becky Moriarty  
J.M. Sorrell

Route Committee Members

Brian O'Leary, Chairman  
Paul Burns Johnson  
Nancy Talbot  
Peter Miller  
J.M. Sorrell

Compensation Committee

Paul Burns Johnson, Chairman  
Brian O'Leary  
Mark Gold  
Doug Slaughter

Nominations Committee Members

David Moskin, Chairman  
Doug Slaughter  
Brian O'Leary  
Paul Burns Johnson

Futures Committee Members

Doug Slaughter, Chairman  
Brian O'Leary  
David Moskin  
Peter Miller

Executive Committee Members

Agawam  
Amherst  
Chicopee  
Holyoke  
Longmeadow  
Northampton

**8. CONFLICT OF INTEREST ACKNOWLEDGEMENT FORM**

**9. ETHICS TRAINING CERTIFICATE**

**10. DISCLOSURE STATEMENTS**

Brandy Pelletier, PVTA's Clerk updated the Board on the following items needed for 2018:

8. State Conflict of Interest Acknowledgment Form is included in your board packet. Please read and complete the acknowledgement form.
9. Ethics Training: Please complete the online training and return the certification of completion for State Level. Training is valid for two years.
10. PVTA Disclosure Statement. Please read and complete the acknowledgement form.

**11. FARE INCREASE DISCUSSION**

David Elvin from the Pioneer Valley Planning Commission gave a presentation on PVTA's fare increase proposals and stated that PVTA is looking for a recommendation on a proposal to go out to public hearings with. The Finance & Audit Committee has made the recommendation to go out to public hearings on a 25% fare increase as well as with a multi-year increase of 5% per year implemented every three years.

The first chart presented shows the fare type, existing fare and three fare increase proposals for both fixed route and paratransit, increasing fares by 20%, 25% and 50%. These proposals also include charging a premium fare for paratransit trips beyond ¾ mile of a fixed route.

The second chart presented options for a multi-year fare increase for:

- 20% fare increase in FY19 then 5% per year implemented every three years
- 25% fare increase in FY19 then 5% per year implemented every three years
- 20% fare increase in FY19 then 10% per year implemented every three years
- 25% fare increase in FY19 then 10% per year implemented every three years

Paul Burns made the motion to accept the recommendation of the sub-committee to go out to public hearings on a 25% fare increase as well as with a multi-year increase of 5% per year implemented every three years.

**MOTION:** Moved and seconded (Burns/Wilson) to go out to public hearings on a 25% fare increase as well as with a multi-year increase of 5% per year implemented every three years.

Mark Gold: For clarification, is it a 5% increase every three years.

Paul Burns: It was the intent of the two committee's recommendation for a 5% annual increase to then be implemented every three years, not a 5% increase every three years.

Steve Huntley: Think of this as a maximum amount. If we don't need the 15% then we can revisit the amount.

Chairman Narkewicz asked if there was any discussion. Hearing none; asked all those in favor to say aye.

Mark Gold opposed.

Motion passed by a majority vote.

## **12. FY19 SERVICE CHANGES DISCUSSION**

Krystal Oldread, PVTA's Director of Operations and Planning gave a presentation on the service reduction scenarios and stated the following:

PVTA has seven different scenarios for service changes:

Scenario 1: Prioritize Geographic Coverage by Preserving Bus Routes Region wide

Scenario 2: Prioritize High Ridership Routes

Scenario 3: Reduce Non-required Van and Bus Services

Scenario 4: Reduce Off-Peak Weekend and Holiday Service

Scenario 5 Reduce Off-peak and Restructure Low Performing Routes and Services

Scenario 6: Prioritize Weekday Geographic Coverage and Weekend High Ridership Routes

Scenario 7: Return to FY13 Level of Service

Scenario one: This scenario prioritizes maintaining as many bus routes as possible across the entire PVTA service area, regardless of ridership and cost per rider. In order to maintain this level of service, reductions would be made to the frequencies and spans of service on Tier 1 and Tier 2 routes which operate in densely populated areas. This scenario would maintain service to suburban and rural communities, but would cause longer wait times, overcrowding, and possibly lower ridership on routes serving PVTA hubs in downtown Springfield, Chicopee, Holyoke, and at UMass-Amherst. This strategy would adversely impact (eliminate or significantly delay) approximately 2 million passenger trips per year, roughly 20% of all PVTA trips. This scenario is the second greatest rider impact of the seven scenarios presented.

Scenario two: This scenario would preserve the more frequent and longer spans of service on high-ridership routes that operate in densely populated areas. Service reductions would be made to lower ridership routes in suburban and rural areas. There would be greater cost savings on a per passenger basis because the outlying routes that would be reduced or eliminated have significantly higher costs per passenger. This is because while the cost of operating a bus is the same for any route, there are fewer riders on outlying routes. Cutting low ridership routes yields more savings per passenger while impacting fewer overall riders.

Due to racial and income segregation in our region as a whole, there are fewer riders of color and low-income on suburban routes, as compared to the urban routes. This means that reducing service on suburban and rural routes will require fewer mitigation services to assure that service reductions are not discriminatory.

Scenario three: PVTA has long recognized the critical mobility needs of seniors and people with disabilities and has provided additional van transportation for these residents of our region. This service is not required by federal law, but is directed by PVTA policy. Much of this service is "demand response" or fixed route with very low ridership. This is among the most costly service on a per passenger basis that PVTA operates.

One such "above and beyond" service involves PVTA's ADA van policy. Instead of meeting the federal requirement to provide complementary accessible van service within ¼-mile of all bus routes, PVTA provides ADA van service to and from any destination within most PVTA municipalities. A

second service is PVTA's Senior Service, "Dial-a-Ride" program, which operates Monday through Saturday from 8:00AM to 4:30PM to provide accessible van rides to residents of twenty PVTA communities who are age 60 and older. PVTA also supports municipal senior van service in four PVTA communities through the local councils on aging. A third type of service is related to bus routes that travel outside PVTA's service area: Route G5 travels to Enfield, Connecticut; Route 46 travels to Whately and South Deerfield; and the Nashawannuck Express travels to the Big Y in Southampton.

This scenario focuses on the potential savings if PVTA were to place greater priority on service which is federally required (ADA within ¼-mile of bus routes only); scale back Senior Services; and eliminate service outside the PVTA's defined service area. The possible savings, while not eliminating the budget deficit in total, would make up approximately 75% of the deficit.

Scenario four: This scenario looks at reducing PVTA's services during "off-peak" times when there is less overall travel demand, typically weekends and holidays. In the past, PVTA did not operate on Sundays. This scenario would also lessen the impact of service cuts on trips to school, work, and medical appointments, which are the three top trip purposes of PVTA riders. The majority of weekend bus service is provided by Tier 1 and Tier 2 routes, these routes would be disproportionately impacted by the reductions proposed in this scenario. Riders of ADA complementary service for those routes would also lose service. However, there would also be some impacts to non-Tier 1 and non-Tier 2 routes, as many do not run on Sunday. This scenario proposes reducing existing Saturday bus service to the levels that currently operate on Sundays and eliminating Sunday service system-wide. While the number of passenger trips affected in this scenario is less than Scenarios 1 and 2, the disruption to those customers would still be substantial. Increasingly, jobs held by PVTA riders are second and third shifts and, often on weekends.

Scenario five: To avoid the most severe impacts of Scenarios 1 through 4, this fifth scenario "Reduce off peak and restructure low performing routes and services" was developed. It draws upon the measures from the other scenarios that have the greatest cost savings and fewest rider impacts. Also, this scenario maintains service on Saturdays, Sundays, and holidays, within all PVTA member communities, and does not eliminate service in communities with limited service which experienced cuts in FY18.

This scenario impacts the least amount of passenger trips while achieving the necessary savings. It's estimated to yield approximately \$3.6 million in savings, which exceeds the \$3.1 million deficit estimate. The additional savings are important, as many of the necessary major service changes involved will disproportionately affect large proportions of minority and low-income riders. In these cases, some service will have to be added back to reduce the impacts of all cuts to a fair level.

Scenario Six: To avoid the most severe impacts of Scenarios 1 through 4, this sixth scenario "Prioritize Weekday Geographic Coverage and Weekend High Ridership Routes" has been developed. It preserves weekday service for the outlying communities and weekend service on the core urban routes.

Scenario Seven: The strategy used was to eliminate service improvements that were implemented since 2013. Many of these improvements were the result of the Comprehensive Service Analysis (CSA). CSA recommendations implemented by PVTA that were to reorganize service/routes and did not incur additional costs are not included for elimination. Route reduction/eliminations that were recommended from the CSA and implemented by PVTA were not reinstated.

Brian O'Leary: The Route and Paratransit sub committees recommended scenario five as presented and made the motion to go out to public hearings on scenario five.

**MOTION:** Moved and seconded (O’Leary/Ishler) to use scenario five as presented to go out to public hearings.

Chairman Narkewicz asked if there was any discussion. Hearing none; asked all those in favor to say aye.

Motion passed by a unanimous vote.

### **13. AUTHORIZATION TO HOLD PUBLIC HEARINGS ON FARE INCREASES AND SERVICE CHANGES**

Paul Burns made the motion to authorize PVTA to hold public hearings on the motions passed today for a 25% fare increase, a multi-year increase of 5% per year implemented every three years and service changes based on scenario five as presented.

**MOTION:** Moved and seconded (Burns/Huntley) to authorize PVTA to hold public hearings on the motions passed today for a 25% fare increase, a multi-year increase of 5% per year implemented every three years and service changes based on scenario five as presented.

Chairman Narkewicz asked if there was any discussion. Hearing none; asked all those in favor to say aye.

Motion passed by a unanimous vote.

### **14. ADMINISTRATOR’S REPORT**

Sandra Sheehan, PVTA’s Administrator reported the following:

PVTA would like to invite the Advisory Board to the Legislative Luncheon that is being held on March 8<sup>th</sup> at the Omni Parker House in Boston. If you would like to attend please let me know. Also PVTA will be sending all the information the Board voted on today to the delegation to keep them informed of our situation and steps that PVTA is taking to balance the budget.

PVTA has a new Mobility Trainer that will be working with seniors and individuals with mobility impairments. The Mobility Trainer along with other PVTA staff will be hosting a meet and greet with the Springfield Seniors sometime during the week of February 5<sup>th</sup>. Seniors will tour Union Station and will be greeted by PVTA staff to take their photo ID and talk about bus service.

Ms. Sheehan thanked PVTA staff and the contractors for all their hard work on the proposals, analyses and cost estimations.

### **15. NEW BUSINESS**

Chairman Narkewicz stated that the Advisory Board is going to need a Special Meeting to vote on the proposed fare and service changes in April. The date is tentatively scheduled for April 11<sup>th</sup> but may change based upon the Board’s availability and PVTA’s Clerk will post the meeting notices accordingly.

### **16. OLD BUSINESS**

PVTA Disparate & Disproportionate Impacts Policy:



David Elvin: At the November 15<sup>th</sup> Advisory Board Meeting, the Board was asked to adopt a Public Participation Plan and approve PVTA's Disparate & Disproportionate Impacts Policy as a separate piece included in the plan. The question arose if PVTA can change the threshold amount for disparate and disproportionate impacts and the vote was tabled until we had more information. The answer is no, PVTA is unable to change the threshold amount in the middle of a Title VI Program. However, the Board does still need to approve the policy.

Paul Burns made the motion to approve PVTA's Disparate & Disproportionate Impacts Policy.

**MOTION:** Moved and seconded (Burns/Slaughter) to approve PVTA's Disparate & Disproportionate Impacts Policy.

Chairman Narkewicz asked if there was any discussion. Hearing none; asked all those in favor to say aye.

Motion passed by a unanimous vote.

FY18 Title VI Service Changes Equity Analysis:

David Elvin: At the July 19<sup>th</sup> meeting the Board should have approved the Title VI Service Changes Equity Analysis but the document was not complete. Now that the document has been completed, the Board needs to vote to approve the analysis.

Brian O'Leary made the motion to approve PVTA's Title VI Service Changes Equity Analysis.

**MOTION:** Moved and seconded (O'Leary/Huntley) to approve PVTA's Title VI Service Changes Equity Analysis.

Chairman Narkewicz asked if there was any discussion. Hearing none; asked all those in favor to say aye.

Motion passed by a unanimous vote.

## **17. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting of the Advisory Board adjourned (Ishler/Burns) at 1:21 P.M.

**A TRUE RECORD**

ATTEST:

  
**BRANDY PELLETIER**

Documents filed with Board Meeting packet:

- Regular Advisory Board Minutes of 11-15-17
- Sub Committee Appointments
- Proposed Fare Increases Presentation
- Proposed Service Change Scenario Presentation
- PVTA Disparate & Disproportionate Impacts Policy
- FY18 Title VI Service Changes Equity Analysis

**Minutes Approved: April 9, 2018**

